

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Greg Bunce, Alternate
Mike Deskin
Elias Esquer
Bob Gasser, Chair
Ann Patterson
Stu Siefer
Liz Wilson, Vice-Chair

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER

Joe Nucci

The City of Tempe is a
Certified Local
Government,
in association with the
United States Department
of the Interior/National
Park Service

Tempe Historic
Preservation Office
Community Development
Department
21 East 6<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 208
P.O. Box 5002
Tempe, AZ 85280

**480.350.8028** 8579 FAX; 8913TDD



# Staff Report

to the Historic Preservation Commission (Tempe HPC)

HPC Neighborhood Presentation: April 6, 2006

HPC Meeting: April 13, 2006

# Roosevelt Addition Historic District

Preliminary Determination of Eligibility

#### **BACKGROUND / STATUS**

Application materials for designation of the above-referenced property as a Tempe Historic District and listing in the Tempe Historic Property Register were transmitted to: 1) Mike Schmidt, owner 616 W Third Street, and 2) Mary Vrizuela, owner 612 W Third Street. An application for historic property designation has not yet been received by the Historic Preservation Office, however, on March 10, 2006, HPO received a call from Margaret Strength, owner 621 W Third Street, requesting a presentation to the Roosevelt Addition neighbors regarding the process and benefits of creating an historic district and listing property in the Tempe Historic Property Register.

Present zoning of the proposed district is R1-6, Single-Family Residential. The area is identified as a "Cultural Resource Area" in General Plan 2030. Note that the area zoned R1-6 at the southeast corner of Third and Roosevelt Streets was not developed during the period of subdivision construction from 1946 through 1950, but remained vacant lots. Note further that this property is the site of the relocated 1888 Centennial [Sampson-Tupper] House, a property listed individually in the Tempe Historic Property Register, but not contributing to the recommended Roosevelt Addition Historic District.

ZDC Neighborhood Meeting Date: not currently scheduled HPC Public Hearing Date: not currently scheduled P&Z Public Hearing Date: not currently scheduled Council 1<sup>st</sup> Public Hearing Date: not currently scheduled Council 2<sup>nd</sup> Public Hearing Date: not currently scheduled

## **SUMMARY**

The Roosevelt Addition is an excellent candidate for historic district designation and listing in the Tempe Historic Property Register. The Roosevelt Addition was the first subdivision developed in Tempe according to the design standards for FHA loans. Although begun as a local small business enterprise, the property was quickly acquired by Phoenix realtor, W. T. Helms who hired the Loftin Construction Company to complete the subdivision. The subdivision is associated with the Community Planning and Development: Tempe 1945-1950 historic context (association with the post-war metro housing boom) and falls under the National Association of Home Builders classification of a small (<25 units) subdivision. Substantially completed within the four year period from 1946 to 1950, this is considered to be a highly successful subdivision. The subdivision maintains a high degree of historic integrity and therefore is associated with the Architectural Design and Construction: Tempe 1945-1950 historic context and the Residential Flood Irrigation: Tempe 1945-1958 historic context, which have significant effect on the character of the neighborhood.

## **HISTORY**

On March 18, 1946, J. J. McCreary filed a plat and requested annexation of the subdivision of 22 lots along 3rd Street, west of Roosevelt Street. William M. Blythe, a local contractor, was hired to start building frame and stucco houses at a cost of less than \$6,000 each. Blythe built a home for himself in the Roosevelt Addition. In August 1946, Phoenix realtor, W. T. Helms bought most of the remaining lots from McCreary and contracted with the Loftin Construction Company of Phoenix to build 16 two-bedroom, 850 square feet cement block houses with steel sash windows, composition shingle roofing at a cost of \$4,000 each. By fall of 1947, Helms was offering the two-bedroom homes for sale for \$7,750. According to the builder's advertising, among the most important features of the houses, were "FHA-Approved! GI Financing!" In 1950, Roosevelt Addition property owners formed Improvement District Number 38 - Roosevelt Addition Irrigation System Additions to extend city residential flood irrigation service to the subdivision.

#### CONTEXT

The history of Tempe during the post-World War II period, 1946-1960, is characterized by rapid population growth in an expanding economy. From 1940 to 1950, Tempe's population grew from 2,906 to 7,686, an increase of 235%. In the following decade growth was even more pronounced. In 1960, the city's population reached 24,897 giving Tempe a rate of growth of 324% throughout the 1950s. More than one hundred new subdivisions were opened for development, and with frequent annexations, Tempe's city boundaries were constantly expanding. These characteristic trends are clearly reflected in the thousands of houses and structures that were built in Tempe during this period.

While Phoenix pursued its dream of becoming the leading commercial and political center of Arizona, Tempe remained strongly committed to agriculture until the war ended. Fields surrounding Tempe had long been productive and profitable, initially based on year-round production of alfalfa and grain, then shifting to cotton production, and finally after the Cotton Crash of 1920, returning to alfalfa and grain as components of a more diverse agronomy. It was during this post war expansion period that housing demand would drive development-based land values to overcome the profitability of productive Tempe agricultural lands.<sup>1</sup>

The following historic contexts have been identified by Tempe HPC as a basis for evaluating the historic significance of candidate districts.

	Arizona State University (association with development of the campus)
	Custom Homes (architect designed, or builder variants)
X	Tract Homes (association with the post-war metro housing boom)
X	Flood Irrigation (residential utility service)
	Prominent Persons (association with significant Tempe citizens)
	Mom-and-pop developers (local small business or one-time enterprises)
X	Corporate developers (see subdivision size classifications)
X	Subdivision Size (National Association of Home Builders classifications: small <25 units
	medium 26 - 100 units, large >100 units)

On October 11, 2003, Commissioner Wilson prepared a matrix comparing characteristics of Tempe's HP Eligible Early Suburban Residential Districts. Information is provided for Roosevelt Addition as follows:

- year subdivision platted = 1946
- number of lots = 22
- build out 1946~1950 (highly successful 1-5 yrs)
- Subdivision Size = Small, <25 homes</li>
- Subdivision Type = tract
- Subdivision Operations = J. J. McCreary (Local Developer), W. T. Helms (Corporate Developer); William Blythe (1 home), Loftin Construction (16 homes)
- Average House Size (sq ft) = 1,100 typical
- Street Patterns = cul-de-sag
- Landscape Patterns = flood irrigation
- Significance Summary = first subdivision to adopt FHA design standards, offered FHA & VA terms / tract development / corporate developer / significant physical design/construction characteristics = uniform house designs.<sup>2</sup>

#### CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION

The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association, and:

_X_	A. That are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history (Community Planning and Development); or		
	B. That are associated with the lives of significant persons in or past; or		
X	C. That embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction (Architectural Styles); or		
	D. That have yielded or may be likely to yield, information important in history or prehistory. <sup>3</sup>		

Roosevelt Addition Historic District in Tempe, Arizona, demonstrates community planning and development after World War II. This subdivision is laid out in a cul-de-sac configuration with homes of uniform architectural design typical of Early/Transitional Ranch style houses. Neighborhood elements are consistent with post-World War II subdivisions satisfying the demand for housing returning veterans and their families. The single-family house on its individual lot within a contained neighborhood is significant for a majority of Americans in the mid-twentieth century. The combination of federal loan financing with simple design and construction allowed suburbs to be developed quickly and inexpensively at the perimeter of the city proper. The cul-de-sac pattern allowed for automobile usage but maintained the atmosphere of a relatively secluded neighborhood. Roosevelt Addition is accessible from Roosevelt Street, at the 600 block of Third Street. Although the subdivision is located approximately three blocks west of Mill Avenue and the heart downtown Tempe, the neighborhood remains relatively isolated from traffic. With the cul-de-sac configuration, the homes radiate off Third Street to the north, south, and west, and retain a great deal of their original integrity and feeling.

## **DESCRIPTION**

Roosevelt Addition subdivision was platted in 1946 at the periphery of the Tempe city core. It is accessible from Roosevelt Street, located west of the 600 block of Third Street in a cul-de-sac configuration. Small homes are built on large lots radiating off the Third Street cul-de-sac to the north, south, and west. The subdivision is located approximately three blocks west of Mill Avenue and the heart of downtown Tempe and four blocks south of Rio Salado Parkway. The contrast between the subdivision layout and the grid pattern of the original townsite marks the transformation of approach to community planning and development in Tempe from its agricultural origins to expansion by real estate speculators in the postwar period. It also indicates a shift in the demographics of Tempe's population and the trend toward greater housing density following World War II.

Roosevelt Addition is laid out in a cul-de-sac pattern of residential development in contrast with the street grid blocks of the original townsite. The design facilitated increased automobile usage by residents while maintaining the friendly feel of the neighborhood as there is no reason to enter the cul-de-sac unless one is associated with the residences located therein. As a result, idle traffic is not encouraged to enter the Roosevelt Addition and it retains a relatively secluded and quiet atmosphere.

Roosevelt Addition exhibits a uniformity and cohesive visual character for all 20 homes, 16 of which were constructed by the same builder. The notable exception is Centennial House located at 601 West Third Street, which was constructed in 1888 in the then popular Colonial Revival style and moved to its present location in 1988. Centennial House was listed in the Tempe Historic Property Register on December 1, 2005, on the basis of its significance as the oldest brick residence, which is also believed to be the first brick residence, constructed in Tempe.<sup>4</sup>

Roosevelt Addition properties have lush foliage watered by residential flood irrigation which shade and border the lots. Some homes have shrubbery growing close to the house and in some cases this vegetation obstructs the view of the house thereby adversely effecting property integrity. A variety of tree and shrub species are present indicating each homeowner could choose his or her landscaping.

Roosevelt Addition has sidewalks and streetlights are located at the rear of the cul-de-sac and mid-block on the north side of Third Street. The property at 624 W 3<sup>rd</sup> Street has a fence around the front perimeter of the property. Many properties have fences around the rear yards and there is no alley or rear entry for these properties. New additions have been made to the rear or side of the structures and some of the homes have added carports. The properties at 633 and 640 W 3<sup>rd</sup> Street have altered front facades with new siding, windows and doors. Driveways are concrete, gravel, or dirt with and without definite borders.

Roosevelt Addition represents early post-World War II housing development in a planned neighborhood with simple design to facilitate quick, economical construction. The homes were affordable for the working-class families that originally occupied the subdivision and the location was convenient to downtown Tempe and Arizona State College at Tempe.

## **ARCHITECTURAL STYLE**

Roosevelt Addition consists predominately of Early/Transitional Ranch style homes. This style combined function, simplicity, and affordability, in a product suitable to the arid western landscape. The simple design and construction techniques could cost as little as \$7,750 for these one-story homes. At the end of World War II housing styles were in transition; revival and bungalow styles were waning and the ranch-house movement was poised to begin market dominance. Early/Transitional Ranch style homes combined elements of both past and future eras. The small box-like form had an L-shaped plan with a low pitched gable end or hip roof. These homes were constructed of brick, often laid up in interesting geometric patterns. In the Roosevelt Addition, the predominant bond pattern was the distinctive row-lock brick masonry type. Brick masonry, and especially row-lock brick masonry, houses are rare in Tempe, and very rare throughout the Valley. Row-lock brick masonry was only used briefly before concrete block largely replaced this method of residential construction. The ephemeral trend is evidenced in the Roosevelt Addition as the 16 homes built by Loftin in 1947 and 1948 are rowlock brick masonry, while the two homes build in 1949 and 1950 are concrete masonry. Often horizontal wood siding is used on the gable ends. Windows were typically steel-sash, crankcasement type in the classic small pane configuration or with elongated horizontal panes, and usually without trim. Foundations were concrete slab-on-grade and roofs were asphalt shingle.5

Roosevelt Addition homes are typical of Early/Transitional Ranch style homes constructed with no true porch, but with broad overhanging eaves at the juncture of the two wings supported by porch posts. The eave is also seen extending along the primary façade to provide a distinct entry veranda supported by two or three posts. The property at 629 W 3<sup>rd</sup> Street has ornamental ironwork posts reflecting French Colonial adornment. The property at 604 W 3<sup>rd</sup> Street has an Art Moderne influence in the design of porch and posts.<sup>6</sup>

Roosevelt Addition homes typically have carports, possibly added later, but not detrimental to the overall integrity of the structures. Most of the properties have outbuildings or sheds at the rear or side of the parcel. Homes have been painted in light pastel colors typical of the period of significance and many feature complimentary contrasting trim colors.

Roosevelt Addition includes several variant house forms in addition to the 16 Early/Transitional Ranch style homes. The property at 604 W 3<sup>rd</sup> Street has a home built in the National Folk Ranch style. This one-story home has a low-pitched pyramidal hip roof with overhanging eaves. This wood-frame home has a stucco finish. Windows are steel casement without trim and the small porch has an extended eave. With 1,356 square feet under roof, this house is considerably larger than the predominant Early/Transitional Ranch style homes.

The property at 610 W 3<sup>rd</sup> Street is a one-story square plan with box-like massed wood-frame construction, clapboard siding, and a low-pitched gable asphalt shingle roof. Original windows appear to have been replaced in their original openings. The front porch is an extension of the roof gable and the house has no ornamentation. Supported on pier footings, the house is reputed to have been moved into the neighborhood in 1946. This is both the earliest house and the smallest house in the neighborhood with 720 square feet under roof. Solliday 2001 finds this property notable as the single prefab dwelling in the Roosevelt Addition. The property is in the process of being permitted for demolition and new construction of the Evans House, a proposed 5,000 square foot single-family residence.<sup>7</sup>

#### **INTEGRITY**

Roosevelt Addition Historic District retains sufficient architectural integrity to convey its historic significance. The suburban plan and street features, residential architecture, and landscaping still appear essentially as they did during the mid-twentieth century. The setting for the houses along the cul-de-sac has changed little since 1950. Small houses built on large parcels maintain a constant rhythm of facades along the street with little variation. To date there has been no modern infill and Centennial House at the southeast district boundary is the only structure not dating to the 1946 to 1950 period of significance.<sup>8</sup>

Roosevelt Addition Historic District contributing properties vary only slightly in individual levels of architectural integrity. Collectively, they readily convey the historic character of their period of significance. Some houses have been repaired and maintained and still look as they did in the last half of the 1940s. Some houses have sustained alterations and additions during either the historic or modern periods to adapt then to contemporary lifestyles. Typical changes involve replacement of steel casement windows or fixed pane windows with aluminum windows in original, unaltered openings. Room additions to the rear and carport additions to the side are also typical changes. Overall, changes to individual properties do not substantially or adversely affect the character of the streetscape as a whole.

The Solliday 2001 evaluation of neighborhood integrity was based on several factors including the proportion of individual properties that possess a high level of integrity, the presence of all of a subdivision's key non-residential elements (streets, vegetation, irrigation system, etc.), and the absence of any significant non-conforming encroachments in residential areas. Only those houses that portray the highest level of architectural integrity (i.e., that still possess all elements of their original design) were reported as contributing properties in Solliday 2001.

Solliday 2001 surveyed 22 lots in the Roosevelt Addition and evaluated 11 properties built between 1946 and 1950 as contributing to an historic district. Solliday 2001 noted 1 property (Centennial House) was previously listed in the Tempe MRA. Solliday 2001 noted 6 properties were not listed due to integrity. Roosevelt Addition reported high integrity in the 2001 survey with 70% (n=14) evaluated as contributing properties. More than two-thirds of the 21 properties within the subdivision boundaries were evaluated as contributing to an historic district.

The 2001 study consistently applied more strict tests for integrity than the standards currently accepted by Tempe HPC. This has been seen in other subdivisions that have recently been reevaluated by Tempe HPC (Borden, Campus, Date Palm Manor). Fieldwork conducted by Staff on March 23, 2006 indicated closer to 86% integrity in Roosevelt Addition.<sup>9</sup>

Solliday 2001 identified a number of External Threats to maintaining neighborhood integrity at various locations in Tempe including; the Apache Boulevard Redevelopment Project and the Central Phoenix/East Valley Light Rail Transit Project. He noted the neighborhoods that are most vulnerable to external threats tend to be in areas west of downtown Tempe (Section 16) and east of Rural Road (Sections 23 and 24). Located in the southeast quarter of Section 16, the Roosevelt Addition is also exposed to noise from Sky Harbor Airport. Areas of elevated noise levels occur in an irregular contour emanating from the runways and stretching from nearly 15th Avenue in Phoenix to past Rural Road in Tempe. Sky Harbor and the City of Phoenix have implemented a residential airport noise mitigation program that provides window replacement and other architectural remediation treatments that can potentially have adverse effects on the architectural integrity of historic properties.

Since completion of Solliday 2001, Tempe has implemented a new General Plan and a new Zoning & Development Code. These instruments seek to facilitate a new urban vision for the community through infill and redevelopment accommodations. While this overarching goal may revitalize many areas, potential impacts on the historic integrity of Cultural Resource Areas may be less certain. Often residents themselves are most intimately aware of changes to the quality of life within their neighborhood. Residents of the Roosevelt Addition have communicated their concerns about the risks facing this area in the near term and it is not inappropriate to consider the relative exposure to risk for specific resources in a determination of historic designation. In addition to the teardown phenomenon promulgated by decreased R1-6 development standards, the Roosevelt Addition Historic District is located adjacent to the University-Hayden Butte Redevelopment Overlay District and the Rio Salado Overlay District. The purpose of these districts is to accomplish the objectives of the specific area plans adopted by the City Council including infill and redevelopment to higher densities.<sup>10</sup>

#### **INVENTORY OF CONTRIBUTING PROPERTIES**

Site #	Common Name	Site Address	Style	Construction Date
HPS-2175	Zimmerman House	600 W 3rd St	National Folk Ranch	1948
HPS-2176	Hool Rental House	604 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1948
HPS-2177	Evans House	610 W 3rd St	Ranch	1946
HPS-2178	Vrizuela House	612 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1948
HPS-2179	Schmidt House	616 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1948
12431006	Hosmer Rental House	620 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1948
12431007	Wilt Rental House	624 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1948
HPS-2180	Hand House	628 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1948
HPS-2181	Wright Rental House	632 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	
HPS-2182	Wilt Rental House	636 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1948
12431012	Wilt Rental House	641 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1948
12431013	Cooper House	639 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1948
HPS-2183	Unruh House	629 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1948
12431016	Gay Rental House	625 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1947
HPS-2184	Vesely House	621 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1947
12431018	Kunkel Rental House	617 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1947
12431019	Wright Rental House	615 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1949
HPS-2185	Thompson House	611 W 3rd St	Early/Transitional Ran	ch 1950

# **INVENTORY OF NONCONTRIBUTING PROPERTIES**

Site # Common Name Site Address Style Cons	struction Date
12431011 Fischer House 640 W 3rd St Early/Transitional Ranch	1948
12431014 Myers House 633 W 3rd St Early/Transitional Ranch	1948
THPR# 28 Centennial House 601 W 3rd St Colonial Revival	1888 (1988)

#### **SIGNIFICANCE**

Roosevelt Addition Historic District is significant under National Register Criteria A for its association with the theme of Community Planning and Development from 1945-1960 (1958) in Tempe, Arizona, and Criteria C for Design/Construction. Resources in the Roosevelt Addition Historic District associated with the post-World War II era in Tempe are typical of construction activity seen throughout the post-war United States. "Sun Belt" states such as Arizona drew new manufacturing industries and veterans who took advantage of educational and financial benefits characteristic of the period. Neighborhood design follows Federal Housing Authority (FHA) guidelines for subdivisions which then permitted veterans and other buyers to qualify for long-term, low interest home loans underwritten by the Federal government. Roosevelt Addition Historic District, with mostly Early/Transitional Ranch house types, allowed affordable housing to be constructed quickly to help address the critical housing shortage in post-World War II Tempe. Most of the homes have retained the integrity of their historical period and were constructed before 1950, making the Roosevelt Addition Historic District a first-tier subdivision eligible for historic district designation and listing in the Tempe Historic Property Register. Roosevelt Addition property owners formed an improvement district in 1950 to extend city residential flood irrigation service to the neighborhood. 11

The Solliday 2001 survey included an examination of approximately 4,500 properties that were built in Tempe between 1946 and 1960. From this survey, inventory forms were completed for 62 subdivisions and nearly 1,800 individual properties. Each postwar subdivision was evaluated for its historic and architectural significance, as well as integrity. The significance of a subdivision was determined by its relation to historic themes, such as community planning and development, federal housing policy, or association with prominent builders and developers.

From a universe of over 100 original post-war subdivisions, Solliday 2001 recommended seven subdivisions to be considered for nomination to the National Register of Historic Places as historic districts. Each of these subdivisions has some significant historical associations. Most or all of the houses in these neighborhoods were built before 1950, and most of the houses, as well as the subdivisions themselves, exhibit a fairly high level of integrity. Obtaining historic district status for these subdivisions will provide recognition and protection of these earliest residential areas in the city that still convey their historic appearance and sense of place.

The Roosevelt Addition was the first subdivision developed in Tempe according to the design standards for FHA loans. The average area of homes is 1,100 square feet. According to the builder's advertising, among the most important features of the houses, were "FHA-Approved! GI Financing!". 12

#### **HISTORIC OVERVIEW**

Modern settlement on the banks of the Salt River began in 1870, when the first groups of homesteaders built shacks or pitched tents at the natural crossings of the River. Research published by Don Ryden, Doug Kupel, and Scott Solliday documents early historic contexts in Tempe. From initial founding through the period of World War II, Tempe's development remained strongly rooted in agriculture. Tempe and Arizona were relatively unaffected by the Depression of the 1930s due to the diverse agricultural economy, although New Deal funds did provide low-interest loans, grants, and other monetary relief. WPA construction projects built the framework for rapid urbanization that would occur after World War II. The war quickly brought the nation out of the Depression and valley communities benefited from climate and inland location.

The Salt River Valley was the perfect location for wartime industries and military installations. *Historic Homes of Phoenix: An Architectural and Preservation Guide* notes that "by 1945 the Valley had six military facilities: two major air bases, three training fields, and a Naval air station. These facilities created an immediate demand for new housing, stores, and other businesses to meet the needs of thousands of military personnel stationed in the Valley." Tempe farmers benefited from the wartime boom as cotton was in great demand for many military uses. Citrus production was also important and Tempe became a regional shipping center for agricultural products.

Wartime shortages of manufactured goods and the demands of war brought severe restrictions on new construction. This was a time of remarkable population growth in Tempe and there was a serious housing shortage. The shortage became critical after the war when servicemen who trained in the area returned to live here. Also, many of the manufacturing companies that located in the Valley during the war remained and continued to operate in peacetime. In 1945, Arizona State Teachers College became Arizona State College at Tempe offering Bachelor's and Mater's degrees in professional and technical fields. Aided by the G. I. Bill, veterans enrolled at ASC in numbers so large as to require the college to buy military surplus trailers and barracks to provide campus housing for students.

In the two decades after World War II, Tempe and the Valley grew rapidly creating great need for housing. From 1940 to 1950, Tempe's population grew 235% and that was surpassed in the next decade by 324% population growth. More than one hundred new subdivisions were opened for development with corresponding annexations into the city limits. By 1960, Tempe was home to 24, 897 individuals living in the thousands of houses that were built during the post-war period. 13 14 15 16

# **HISTORIC CONTEXTS**

#### Community Planning and Development: Tempe 1945-1950

Due to wartime restrictions, very little building activity occurred in Tempe during World War II, but three new subdivisions were platted early in 1945 as restrictions on building materials began to relax. By February, twenty new homes were under construction and another hundred families who had purchased home sites could not build because of continuing materials shortages. A year after the war a continuing shortage of resources still hampered home construction in Tempe. Recycled wartime facilities from the federal government provided some temporary assistance. Structures form the Papago Park POW Camp and the Rivers Japanese Relocation Center on the Gila River Indian Reservation were dismantled and offered to veterans.

The scarcity of building materials was not the only obstacle to keeping pace with the need for new home construction. Tempe was still a small farming community and, as was common throughout the nation during the Depression, local banks did not offer home mortgages. The Federal Housing Administration (FHA) was created in 1934 to reform lending practices, to insure home mortgages, and to create jobs in the construction industry. In Arizona, Valley National Bank began aggressively promoting home mortgages in Phoenix, Mesa, and other Valley cities, but Tempe banks did not participate in FHA-insured loans until after World War II, when it was estimated that up to four million veterans nation-wide could not find adequate housing and the federal government provided a solution with federally financed mortgages.

Without financing, new home construction was an individual affair and an inherently slow process. The FHA provided advantageous terms and payments could be spread over a period of up to twenty years. To protect their investment, the FHA set rigid standards for eligibility so the houses would not decrease in value over time.

The building block of the post-World War II residential landscape is the single-family house on its own lot situated in the residential subdivision. The FHA used a standard rating system evaluate the quality of construction and design for individual homes and the neighborhoods in which they were located. Lower ratings were applied to neighborhoods where houses were of varying sizes and styles or that were racially integrated because these factors were believed to adversely affect property values. By the late 1940s, corporate builders started adhering to the FHA's building standards, which was a selling point with homebuyers because homes in these subdivisions were pre-approved for mortgage insurance. This, in turn, encouraged large-scale production of virtually identical single-family houses in planned neighborhoods.

FHA financing also brought changes in the housing construction industry. Before WWII, subdividers sold lots to customers, who then contracted with an architect or builder to construct a home on their lot. FHA controls coupled with improved financing, and later post-war economic prosperity, resulted in real estate organizations undertaking both land development and home building on speculation that there would be buyers immediately ready to purchase homes.

Roosevelt Addition Historic District was the first subdivision developed in Tempe according to the design standards for FHA loans. Developer J. J. McCreary and his wife Carrie, filed a plat on March 18, 1946, and requested that the subdivision of 22 lots along Third Street, west of Roosevelt Street, be annexed by Tempe. They designed their subdivision around a cul-de-sac, a new design concept used for the first time in the post-war subdivision of Radburn, New Jersey. The intent is to create a partially enclosed neighborhood and to exclude traffic related to commercial development or main arterial streets located on the subdivision perimeter. In contrast, neighborhoods faced inward with curvilinear streets and cul-de-sacs that kept traffic and noise out of the residential area. William M. Blythe, a local contractor, was hired to start building frame and stucco houses at a cost of less than \$6,000.00 each. Blythe built a home for himself in the Roosevelt Addition. In August 1946, Phoenix realtor W. T. Helms bought most of the lots from McCreary and contracted with the Loftin Construction Company of Phoenix to build 16 two-bedroom cement block houses with steel sash windows and composition shingle roofs. Planned at 850 square feet and a cost of \$4,000.00 each, the original product was not what was ultimately delivered and by fall of 1947, Helms was advertising two-bedroom homes for \$7.500.00 to buyers who could take advantage of the FHA approval and GI financing.

Roosevelt Addition Historic District resources are associated with Community Planning and Development in post World War II Tempe (Criteria A). While new community growth was evident throughout the post-war United States, few communities experienced the vigorous rate of development that was taking place in Tempe and other Valley cities. A "Sun Belt" city with new manufacturing industries, a growing college, availability of land, and absence of geographic barriers allowed Tempe to develop outward in an orderly fashion. Local developers and builders took care to design their subdivisions to follow FHA guidelines for homes and the subdivision as a whole. The convenience of the automobile and the availability of land encouraged suburban development away form the traditional city center. Rather than measure growth in streets and blocks, the explosive post-war housing boom can be expressed in terms of square miles. The unprecedented scale and rate of development in the period of significance (1945-1950) defined the Tempe that exists today.

Roosevelt Addition HPC Presentation 04/06/2006 HPO Preliminary Determination of Eligibility

## Architectural Design and Construction: Tempe 1945-1950

Resources in the Roosevelt Addition Historic District are associated with Design/Construction (Criteria C) as exemplary of the Early/Transitional Ranch house type. The Ranch Era (1935-1960) departed from earlier architectural periods as construction styles reflected growing demand for affordable housing. In Tempe and throughout the Valley, the ranch house type experienced infinite variation in design and craftsmanship as houses adapted to meet an immediate demand for affordable housing took increasing advantage of technical innovations in materials and methods of construction available at end of WWII.

Application of innovative design and manufacturing processes developed by war industries to home building speeded construction and saved costs. Ranch style architecture epitomized this building program as homes did not require a basement or sub-floor foundation which would be difficult to excavate in caliche-laden desert soils. Construction on a cost-efficient concrete slab surmounted by traditional wood frame, brick, or concrete block bearing walls was typical. Builders almost universally provided steel casement windows, sometimes adding corner windows or shutters. Ranch style architecture developed in response to a need to house as many as possible as inexpensively as possible while still providing the American Dream in a pleasant and familiar form. This was the architecture of the war veteran, the frank creation of working class carpenters who constructed housing for millions at the time when the need was greatest. New materials and methods would, over time, come to replace skilled labor at the construction site with increasingly prefabricated product assemblies. From 1945 to 1950, however, homebuilding was still largely the work of craftsmen skilled in the traditional methods of their trades. New materials and methods were being introduced during this period, but they were primarily placed in the hands of experienced tradesmen.

In contrast to previous Period Revival styles, early ranch architecture was deeply rooted in the American West. Based on house forms from California's colonial and territorial periods, the basic ranch form was historically shaped by a scarcity of materials and technology. Houses built immediately after WWII combined elements of both past and future eras, but mostly the World War II Cottage and Early Ranch types were abstractions of residential architecture to its most essential form. Trends away from the exotic designs and materials used in Period Revival homes from the 30s was reinforced by modernism's tenets of simple, clear, unpretentious design. It was, however, economy and demand for small, simple houses in great numbers at the end of the war that caused the Early/Transitional Ranch form to come to dominate the market. Evolution of the house type from Period Revival to World War II Cottage to Early/Transitional Ranch is a process of subtraction, as character defining features of earlier styles are eliminated to reveal the derivative ranch form.

Roosevelt Addition Historic District houses were built before 1950 and most of the houses exhibit a fairly high level of integrity. They have all the classic character defining features of the Early/Transitional Ranch house; one story, L-shaped plans, masonry construction, low-pitched gable roofs, entry porches, steel casement windows, and wood gable ends. Occasionally façades reflect National Folk or International style architectural features. Obtaining historic district status for this subdivision would provide recognition and protection for one of the earliest post-war residential neighborhoods in Tempe that still conveys its historic appearance and sense of place.

Roosevelt Addition HPC Presentation 04/06/2006 HPO Preliminary Determination of Eligibility

# Residential Flood Irrigation: Tempe 1945-1958

During the early years of Tempe's post-war boom, it appeared that residential flood irrigation would continue to be regarded as an essential city service. Irrigation had been a part of Tempe's culture and landscape since the town's founding. When the earliest subdivisions were carved out of farms, developers simply dug more ditches to bring irrigation water to individual lots. The open ditches were gradually replaced by buried pipes beginning in the 1930s, but otherwise the practice of irrigating residential lots continued virtually unchanged.

In 1948, residents of the first two subdivisions to be annexed into the original townsite; College View and University Park, began petitioning the City Council for construction of neighborhood irrigation systems. Council approved formation of the first of several special districts in 1948, and property owners were assessed the cost of improvements to construct a \$31,000 underground irrigation system in University Park and portions of College View in Improvement District 36. Subsequent districts provided irrigation in Roosevelt Addition, Vista Del Rio, Hudson Manor, Borden Homes, and Tomlinson Estates.

After construction, the systems were turned over to the city, which operated them on behalf of the residents. Initially this extension of the municipal irrigation service was challenged by Salt River Project, which allowed the city to deliver irrigation water but only within the original incorporated area. Outside that one square mile area, the Project wanted to supply irrigation water directly to property owners. Its primary concern appears to have been the assessments it collected from landowners. If Tempe residents no longer received their water directly from the Project, they might fall behind in the annual assessments that every Project customer was required to pay in order to continue receiving water. Eventually, Project objections were overcome and SRP and the city signed a new water contract in 1948. As long as property owners in a neighborhood paid their past-due assessments and brought their accounts up to date, the Project allowed them to receive water from the city, which would then pay future annual assessments to the Project when it purchased water for distribution in the Tempe residential flood irrigation program.

For the next decade, every new subdivision in Tempe was developed with an underground irrigation system. On May 01, 1950, Roosevelt Addition property owners formed Improvement District Number 38, the Roosevelt Addition Irrigation System Additions Improvement District, to extend city residential flood irrigation service to the neighborhood.

As a strategy for beautifying the city, the residential irrigation network was a success, as it allowed Tempe's new neighborhoods to quickly acquire lawns and much needed shade trees. However, as a self-supporting utility service, it was a failure. Irrigation customers paid very nominal fees, only \$6 per year in 1946, yet the service was expensive to operate. Unlike the potable water service which was self-supporting, the irrigation service operated with deficits that had to be covered by the city's general fund. As the size of the irrigation system continued to expand, so did the deficits.

In 1958, after learning that the deficit was now \$11,000.00, the city council tried to increase the irrigation fee, which was then \$15 per year. This produced uproar among longtime residents who had grown accustomed to the low-cost service, and the council retreated. Explaining their refusal to raise rates, several council members argued that residential flood irrigation contributed enough to the charm of the neighborhoods and to the character of Tempe to justify using money from the general fund to help pay for this beautification service. In the end, the city halted expansion of its residential flood irrigation service simply because it was a messy chore for homeowners and an expensive program for the city to operate. The last subdivisions to be served with city irrigation were those built in the late 1950s: Broadmor Estates (1956) and Tempe Estates (1958) located along College Avenue south of Broadway Road. <sup>17 18 19</sup>

Roosevelt Addition HPC Presentation 04/06/2006 HPO Preliminary Determination of Eligibility

The Tempe historic context "Residential Flood Irrigation: Tempe 1945-1958" begins with the premise that historic sites include historic landscape features as integral parts of their identity. This context recognizes that preservation of the perceived and actual integrity of flood irrigated neighborhoods requires protection of historically accurate landscapes and landscape elements contained therein. The study of these historic landscapes and their elements provides an understanding of the cultural and social significance of other common visible features in these neighborhoods. Historic landscapes also reveal much about our evolving relationship with the natural world.

To a large extent, historic landscapes are representative of the time and era when they were originally established. Many architectural periods are closely linked to specific landscape patterns and plant palettes; including the FHA subdivision layout of the Roosevelt Addition Historic District. Much of the mental imagery we conjure up when reflecting on Tempe's historic neighborhoods includes recollections of their lush, flood irrigated landscapes. Although there are a variety of plants that have evolved to become associated with these historic landscapes, caution is necessary to avoid developing a false or created sense of history. Long-term effects of the systematic elimination or preservation of historic landscape elements and features will only become more apparent over time. <sup>20</sup>

Conservation of water and energy is an important aspect of sustainable desert living. From the onset, development of Tempe's irrigated neighborhoods was linked to flood irrigation from Valley canals. The shade trees and mesic vegetation attendant upon flood irrigation create a microclimate effect in these neighborhoods by shading structures and grounds. Ultimately, this can cool neighborhoods by as much as ten degrees, thereby decreasing energy demand for air conditioning. Shade also decreases the evapotranspiration rate, allowing vital ground water to stay where it is needed most, instead of being pulled from the ground by the desert sun.<sup>21</sup>

The City of Phoenix has recognized the unique character and richness of associated historic landscapes and exempts historic districts and individual properties from its landscape ordinance, which requires all new development to establish a xeriscape design to better manage water use. The term 'xeriscape' originated in the early 80s and refers to the regulation and use of water on site. Over the past decade, xeriscape landscapes have increased in number and popularity as they help to inform the public about how designed and built landscapes can be made more sustainable. While this conservation and education effort is appropriate to desert living, xeriscape landscapes are not associatively or historically appropriate in the setting of historically flood irrigated districts. Although neighbors will spend considerable time and resources on the betterment of their community through various efforts to conserve and enhance neighborhood quality of life, they often fail to understand that protection and preservation of the rich historic character of special neighborhoods that are candidate historic districts is integrally linked to continued maintenance of the integrity of historically accurate landscapes and landscape elements contained therein.<sup>22</sup>

Tempe Preservation is working with Tempe Water Utility Department to implement incentives for water conservation strategies appropriate to historic preservation objectives in Cultural Resource Areas. The goal of this process is to address conservation principals common to overall neighborhood enhancement and environmental quality.

#### **CHRONOLOGY**

- 03/18/1946 -
- J. J. McCreary filed a plat and requested annexation of the subdivision of 22 lots along 3rd Street, west of Roosevelt Street. William M. Blythe, a local contractor, was hired to start building frame and stucco houses at a cost of less than \$6,000 each. Blythe built a home for himself in the Roosevelt Addition.
- August 1946 Phoenix realtor, W. T. Helms, bought most of the remaining lots from McCreary and contracted with the Loftin Construction Company of Phoenix to build 16 two-bedroom cement block houses with steel sash, composition shingle roofing, and 850 square feet of floor space, at a cost of \$4,000 each.
- 09/12/1947 Helms was offering the two-bedroom homes for sale for \$7,750. According to the builder's advertising, among the most important features of the houses, were "FHA-Approved! GI Financing!"<sup>23</sup>
- 05/01/1950 Roosevelt Addition property owners formed Improvement District Number 38 'Roosevelt Addition Irrigation System Additions', extending city residential flood irrigation service to the neighborhood.
- 12/08/1966 Tempe City Council adopted Annexation Ordinance Number 482 providing annexation of 5 acres for the Roosevelt Addition and bringing Tempe land area to 20.964 square miles.<sup>24</sup>
- 12/14/2001 Tempe HPC produces Post World War II Subdivisions Survey (Solliday 2001). This study examined approximately 4,500 properties that were built in Tempe between 1946 and 1960. From this group inventory forms were completed for about 1,500 properties occurring in 62 subdivisions. The Context Study identified 31 subdivisions as candidates for designation as historic districts in two groups; 7 first-tier subdivisions each of which are recommended for designation now, and 25 second-tier subdivisions from which a representative sample of more contemporary districts can be drawn in the future.
- 12/04/2003 Tempe Voters adopt Tempe General Plan 2030 providing Cultural Resource Area designation for 31 candidate historic districts (existing density allowed by zoning). Areas identified on the GP2030 density map, are considered culturally significant to the character of Tempe, based on the 2001 Post World War II Subdivision Study. It is desirable to maintain the character of these areas. The underlying zoning should remain the highest appropriate density for these areas. These areas are shown as Cultural Resource Areas, with a projected density to match the zoning at the time the plan was adopted on December 4, 2003.
- O6/02/2005 Tempe City Council designates the historic 1947 Borden Homes subdivision as Tempe's first historic district, and directed that it be listed on the Tempe Historic Property Register. The purpose of the Borden Homes Historic Overlay District is to provide protection for significant properties which represent important aspects of Tempe's heritage; to enhance the character of the community by taking such properties and sites into account during development, and to assist owners in the preservation and restoration of their properties.

11/10/2005 – At the regular monthly meeting of the Tempe HPC it was determined to prioritize designating the first-tier + 2 subdivisions and refer to this group as "Priority Eligible Historic Subdivisions".

#### RECOMMENDATION

Staff considers the recommendations in Solliday 2001 to remain valid unless integrity conditions have substantially changed in the interim since the study was completed and accepted by Tempe HPC. Staff believes that Solliday 2001 judiciously narrowed the candidate field of 62 extant subdivisions appropriately to 31 potential districts recognized as Cultural Resource Areas in Tempe General Plan 2030. Further, Tempe HPC has indicated that the 2001 test for integrity was more restrictive than commonly accepted standards. Staff would like to see a comprehensive application of an assessment of contextual significance to all Cultural Resource Areas, however, it is not recommended to forestall recognition and protection of apparently qualified districts from the candidate field in the interim. Criteria for designation of historic districts and listing in the Tempe Historic Property Register are provided in Section 14A-4 of the Tempe Historic Preservation Ordinance. Staff submits that the historic 1946 Roosevelt Addition subdivision is of historic significance and expresses a distinctive character, resulting from a significant portion of it being at least fifty (50) years old; it being reflective of the city's cultural, social, political or economic past; and it being associated with events significant in local, state or national history.

Staff recommends that the Tempe Historic Preservation Commission support any forthcoming nomination for historic district designation and listing in the Tempe Historic Property Register of the Roosevelt Addition, and that Tempe HPC direct Staff to assist in this regard.

attachments: vicinity map

site plan photographs

## **ENDNOTES**

- <sup>1</sup> Tempe, City 2006b
- Wilson, Liz 2003
- U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service, 2002
- <sup>4</sup> Tempe, City, 2005b
- On June 12, 1952, the Tempe City Council adopted the 1949 Edition of the Uniform Building Code, as Section 301(a) of the Tempe City Code, the first Tempe building regulation to provide minimum standards to safeguard life, limb, health, property and public welfare. <a href="http://www.tempe.gov/historicpres/docs/HPO-Report BordenHomes.pdf">http://www.tempe.gov/historicpres/docs/HPO-Report BordenHomes.pdf</a>
- <sup>6</sup> Wilson, Liz 2002
- <sup>7</sup> Tempe, City, 2006a
- <sup>8</sup> Bonn, Patricia, 2004
- Solliday, Scott, 2001
- <sup>10</sup> Tempe, City, 2005
- 11 Federal Housing Authority, 1936
- Solliday, Scott, 2001
- Bonn, Patricia, 2004
- <sup>14</sup> Solliday, Scott, 2001
- <sup>15</sup> Solliday, Scott, 1993
- <sup>16</sup> Phoenix, City, 1992
- <sup>17</sup> Pry, Mark E. 2003
- Headman, Ferguson & Carollo Engineers, 1950
- <sup>19</sup> Solliday, Scott, 2001
- <sup>20</sup> Hansen, Eric M., 1999
- <sup>21</sup> Davis, Robinson, 2005
- <sup>22</sup> Hansen, Eric M., 1999
- <sup>23</sup> Tempe Daily News 09/12/1947 (adv)
- <sup>24</sup> Tempe, City, 1966

#### REFERENCES CITED

Bayes, Michelle 1997 – A Historic Preservation Survey and Inventory of Post-World War II Subdivisions in Tempe, Arizona, Volume 1, ASU HIS 525 Historic Resources Management. KARL: 2004.0000.0086

Bonn, Patricia 2004 – Roosevelt Addition Historic District National Register of Historic Places Registration Form, Spring 2004 Arizona State University HIS-525 (Professor Doug Kupel) KARL: 2004.2742.0032

Davis, Robinson 2005 – The Urban Forest; a study of the value and application of trees in an urban environment, Arizona State University College of Architecture and Landscape Architecture (Professor Joseph Ewan, ASLA).

Federal Housing Authority 1936 – Technical Bulletin No. 5, "Planning Neighborhoods for Small Houses" July 1, 1936 <a href="http://www.columbia.edu/cu/gsapp/projs/call-it-home/html/chapter8.1.html">http://www.columbia.edu/cu/gsapp/projs/call-it-home/html/chapter8.1.html</a>

Hansen, Eric M. 1999 – F. Q. Story Neighborhood: an historic landscape threatened, Arizona State University, College of Planning and Landscape Architecture, 1999. KARL: 2004.0000.0206

Headman, Ferguson & Carollo Engineers, 1950 – Improvement District Number 38 - Roosevelt Addition Irrigation System Additions, 05/01/1950 KARL: 2005.0000.0045

Moore-Doyle, Darby 2001 – Post-World War II Subdivision Development in Tempe, Arizona: a historic preservation perspective, paper presented by Darby Moore-Doyle at the National Council on Public History Conference Ottawa, Canada, April 19, 2001 <a href="http://www.geocities.com/histpreservation/PaperPostWIISubdivisions.html">http://www.geocities.com/histpreservation/PaperPostWIISubdivisions.html</a>

Phoenix, City 1992 – Historic Homes of Phoenix; and architectural and preservation guide, Cooper/Roberts Architects, City of Phoenix Historic Preservation Office 1992 ftp://phoenix.gov/pub/HISTORIC/resource.pdf

Pry, Mark E. 2003 – Oasis in the Valley; the story of water in Tempe, Tempe Historical Museum & Tempe Water Utilities Department, 2003 KARL: 2004.0000.0040

Ryden Architects, 1997 – City of Tempe Multiple Resource Area Update, Volume 1: Survey Report. City of Tempe Historic Preservation Office KARL: 2000.2043.589

Solliday, Scott 2001 – Post World War II Subdivisions Tempe 1945-1960; Neighborhood & House Type Context Development, Tempe Historic Preservation Commission, Scott Solliday, Historian, December 14, 2001 KARL: 2001.2043.0330

Solliday, Scott 1993 – Journey To Rio Salado; Hispanic migration to Tempe, Arizona, Master Thesis, Arizona State University, May 1993 KARL: 2001.0000.0203

Tempe City, 2006a – Hearing Officer BA 060011 Use Permit for the Evans Residence to increase lot coverage by 10% from 45% to 49.5% located at 610 W 3rd Street in the R1-6 Single Family Residential District

Tempe City, 2006b – Tomlinson Estates Historic District, HPO Staff Report 02/09/2006, Tempe Preservation Office <a href="http://www.tempe.gov/historicpres/TomlinsonEstatesStaffReport.pdf">http://www.tempe.gov/historicpres/TomlinsonEstatesStaffReport.pdf</a>

Tempe City, 2005a – Zoning and Development Code, amended 12/01/05, Tempe Development Services Department <a href="http://www.tempe.gov/zoning/zdc.htm">http://www.tempe.gov/zoning/zdc.htm</a>

Tempe, City, 2005b – Centennial House Historic Property Designation Staff Report, DSD# HPO-2005.87, 10/13/05 <a href="http://www.tempe.gov/historicpres/CentennialHouseHPStaffReport.pdf">http://www.tempe.gov/historicpres/CentennialHouseHPStaffReport.pdf</a>

Tempe City 1966 – Common Council Annexation Ordinances, 400 Series Annexation Ordinances, Ordinance Number 482, 12/08/1966 Roosevelt Addition KARL: 1999.0000.431

Tempe Daily News 1947 – (advertisement) September 12, 1947, "16 NEW HOMES" Loftin Construction Co. <a href="https://www.tempe.gov/nhoods/images/adriv1.gif">https://www.tempe.gov/nhoods/images/adriv1.gif</a>

U.S. Department of the Interior, 2002 – National Park Service, How to Apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation, updated 2002 online at: http://www.cr.nps.gov/nr/publications/bulletins/nrb15/Index.htm

Wilson, Liz, 2003 – Characteristics of Tempe's HP Eligible Early Suburban Residential Districts summary table in Eligible Historic Subdivision Tour (brochure) Tempe HPC / Tempe NAC 10/11/03. KARL: 2005.2742.0016

Wilson, Liz, 2002 – Postwar Modern Housing and a Geographic Information System Study of Scottsdale Subdivisions,

http://www.ci.scottsdale.az.us/historiczoning/neighborhoods/pdf/postwarstudy.pdf